

## The E-Aspiration System as an Implementation of Public Participation from the Good Governance Perspective

Muhammad Anfasha Wirakusuma<sup>1\*</sup> and Agus Riwanto<sup>2</sup>

<sup>12</sup>Faculty of Law, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia

\*email: manfasha21@gmail.com

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.31603/variajusticia.v18i3.8822>

*Submitted: October 2022    Revised: November 2022    Accepted: December 2022*

---

### ABSTRACT

**Keywords:**  
Democracy;  
Regional  
Autonomy;  
Public  
Participation;  
Good  
Governance

*This research aimed to examine democracy development using e-participation through the e-aspiration system applied in public services to realize the smart city. This refers to online public participation by utilizing information and communication technology. The smart city is related to information and communication technology used in the social field. It could be realized by opening public participation in ensuring the democratic rights of every citizen through e-aspiration. The goal was to capture people's aspirations through the ease of public services provided. This research used a normative juridical method with library research to describe the impact of e-participation in policy formation and improving public services in Magelang City from the Good Governance perspective. As a result, people would directly realize digital government in the modern era. The ease of access in participation would also help the government follow the direction and needs of the people. In implementing the smart city concept, Therefore, this research examined the factors supporting and strengthening public participation in the smart city concept on the Good Governance perspective.*

---

### 1. INTRODUCTION

Rapid technological development affects people's need for fast and precise public services from the government. Information technology has transformed people's basic needs in daily life. The influence of globalization and the strong development of science and technology has made social media a new means of communication between citizens in various circles of society. The use of social media as a culture has different characteristics and typologies from the previous era of media. The development of media structures can provide quick access to the public conversation as opposed to traditional media which provide content but cannot transmit content quickly for others to read or consume as well as the participation of others in the development and dissemination of

information. Website as the main element on the Internet is a popular media of communication and benchmarks of usability and ease of use Information Technology.<sup>1</sup>

The use of digital media in government may not necessarily promote people's well-being, but it demonstrates the government's commitment to delivering maximum public services and permitting involvement. Officials from the government should take an active part in providing and developing public services, as well as administering digital-based services. Increasing government officials' technology mastery would facilitate the management of human and natural resources and increase local revenue. Furthermore, public services would be organized and provided quickly and precisely. This would affect public service systems that reduce the difficulty of bureaucracy and long procedures. Transparency in digital services could also reduce government fraud, such as reducing the potential for extortion and corruption. Therefore, the clarity of digital service systems, procedures, tariffs, time limits, and queues promotes trust in the government and increases the people's interest in policy formation. Magelang City Government is developing the smart city concept in providing public services. The smart city concept applied to big cities in Indonesia is important in providing modern services using advanced technologies and infrastructure. Therefore, it could increase the effectiveness of services and improve the lives of urban people. The concept of e-participation is also a major aspect of improving the quality of public services. In this case, digital public participation would significantly impact digital-based public services. The government's success in addressing people's problems is reflected in the provision of public services. Therefore, the smart city is a breakthrough in providing alternative solutions to problems and improving service performance.<sup>2</sup>

The smart city concept is promoted through private companies' role in information and communication technology. Private companies play a vital role in providing modern facilities that support the development of the concept. IBM has also emphasized that the smart city concept focuses on:<sup>3</sup>

1. Digital technology. Information and communication technology are integral to a city's regional infrastructure.
2. Smart service providers. The products of the smart city concept are science-based services for individuals.

---

<sup>1</sup> Agus Riwanto, "Construction of Legal Culture Model for Corruption Prevention Through Social Media in Indonesia," *Jurnal Hukum Dan Peradilan* 11, no. 3 (2022): 385, <https://doi.org/10.25216/jhp.11.3.2022.385-404>.

<sup>2</sup> Kristia Putri Pangestiningrum, Joko Tri Nugraha, and Mahendrati Mahendrati, "Manajemen Aplikasi 'Magelang Cerdas' Sebagai Salah Satu Inovasi Sektor Publik Menuju Smart City Di Kota Magelang," *Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Kajian Media* 3, no. 1 (2019): 24–36.

<sup>3</sup> Ridwan Sutriadi, *10 Langkah Mencerdaskan Kota, Seri Smart City Dari Sisi Perencanaan Kota*, Smart City (Bandung: ITB, 2017).

3. People. Smart city products should be felt by the people. They are produced as sensor utilization in city infrastructure and the application is to facilitate people's activities and optimize resources.

The smart city concept is also convenient for applying e-government to create a good relationship between the government, people, businesses, the private sector, and other interested parties.

In implementing the smart city concept, Magelang City Government has released a special mobile application called Magelang Cerdas. The naming using the phrase "Cerdas" or smart means this application could effectively help people access public services in one application. The services include licensing, health, and the latest information about the development of Magelang City. Furthermore, the people could access the development of information on typical culinary, tourist attractions, lodging, and hotels to various existing and future agendas. This application contains tourism services and schedules, recommendations for souvenir shops, licensing, and health information. Therefore, Android users could download the mobile application through the Google Play Store platform for free.<sup>4</sup>

The ease of public services provided by the Magelang Cerdas application has created various features that promote e-participation. This refers to online public participation by utilizing information and communication technology and the smart city concept. In this participation, people often give feedback online to various public services provided conventionally and by the Magelang Cerdas application. This shows that public e-participation in providing online feedback is a positive step toward realizing e-government. The people recognize that the ease of conveying aspirations related to services and policies creates a transparent government. This facilitates the openness principle of data used by the people as a benefit of information and electronic systems for government activities. Therefore, this research aimed to analyze the impact of e-participation in policy formation and improving public services in Magelang City.

## 2. RESEARCH METHOD

This research used a normative juridical method with library research to describe the impact of e-participation in policy formation and improving public services in Magelang City from the Good Governance perspective. Data were collected from library material sources, including books, scientific journals, articles, and other literature related to the research objective. While data collection through library research. Furthermore, it will analyze qualitatively and presented descriptively.

---

<sup>4</sup> RM Mahendrardi dan Hardi Warsono, "Peningkatan Kapasitas Aplikasi Mobile 'Magelang Cerdas' Dalam Rangka Peningkatan Pelayanan Publik," *JPALG (Journal of Public Administration and Local Governance)* 4, no. 2 (2020): 124–40, <https://doi.org/10.31002/jpalg.v4i1.2394>.

### 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

#### 3.1. E-participation in Realizing E-Government in Magelang City from the Good Governance Perspective

Modern people are impacted by advances in information and communication technology demands, as well as effective and efficient public services from the government. In line with this, e-government utilizes information technology to solve the demands of services aspired by the people. It is a form of information and communication, and the internet changes the relationship between citizens, business people, government agencies, and other interested parties. It is also implemented to improve government service access and delivery to benefit the people, businesses, employees, and other stakeholders.<sup>5</sup> In early 2022, the world population review (WPR) stated that internet users increased rapidly between 2000 and 2016. Indonesia has ranked 9th of 10 countries with the most internet users worldwide.<sup>6</sup> Also, the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology website showed that Indonesia has the 6th largest population of internet users worldwide as ranked by eMarketeer.<sup>7</sup>

The implementation of e-government in Magelang City is inseparable from the improvement of various public services. According to Law No. 25 of 2009 on Public Service, the services imply administrative activities to fulfill needs appropriate to the laws and regulations for people. The principle regarding the services has standardized everything in advance, including third parties, before entering electronically or manually.<sup>8</sup> E-government is implemented more complexly because the procedures are standardized manually and electronically. Therefore, information services through e-government are automated, and the system is combined into a unified understanding and discussion to facilitate the people.

Magelang Cerdas application is an official city directory-based mobile application issued by the government in participating in e-government towards the Magelang Smart City. The application summarizes information and public services. The feature makes it easier for people to enjoy public services as well as the beauty of the tourist environment and culinary specialties of Magelang City. In organizing e-government, Magelang City Government has involved electronic public participation known as e-participation accessed through the Monggo Lapor feature provided by the Magelang Cerdas application. One feature of Magelang Cerdas provides suggestions, proposals, and complaints and provides information about the city. The government and

---

<sup>5</sup> Trisapto Nugroho, "Analisis E-Government Terhadap Pelayanan Publik Di Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham (Analysis of E-Government to Public Services in the Ministry of Law and Human Rights)," *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum* 10, no. 3 (2016): 279–96.

<sup>6</sup> Statista Research Department, "Countries With The Highest Number of Internet Users 2022," 2022.

<sup>7</sup> Kominfo, "Pengguna Internet Indonesia Nomor Enam Dunia," 2014.

<sup>8</sup> Republik Indonesia, "Law Number 25 of 2009 on Public Services".

the people exchange ideas through responses to this feature while addressing problems in the city. The application is adopted by the government to increase information transparency and people's ease of access. Moreover, it plays a role in increasing public e-participation. The level of public participation measures people's participation. Arnstein (1969) proposed a ladder used by academics to measure public participation. Arnstein proposed a public participation ladder with eight steps describing the participation level in the late sixties. The research showed that many participation ladders were designed to each region's needs and conditions. The ladder has eight steps divided into three categories from the bottom. The three categories are non-participation, tokenism, and citizen power degree. Therefore, the eight steps are divided into manipulation and therapy, informing, consulting, and placing, as well as partnership, delegation, and public control. In this division, the higher the step, the higher the level of participation.<sup>9</sup>

The convenience of the Magelang Cerdas application in providing public services could increase public participation in line with the objectives of Good Governance. This would increase the effectiveness of regional autonomy implementation. Algemene Beginselen van Behoorlijk Bestuur" or "General Principles of Good Governance" (GPGG) has been adopted and applied as an Administrative System in Indonesia. The application of GPGG in the Local Government System is found in several laws and regulations.<sup>10</sup>

Article 2 Law No. 28 of 1999, concerning the administration of a clean State free from corruption, collusion and nepotism, contains several principles of State administration, including:<sup>11</sup>

1. The Principle of Legal Certainty prioritizes the basis of laws and regulations, decency, as well as justice in every policy of State administrators.
2. The Principle of Order is the basis for the order, harmony, and balance in controlling State administrators.
3. The Principle of Public Interest prioritizes the general welfare in an aspirational, accommodating, and selective manner.
4. The Principle of Openness opens to the people's right to obtain correct, honest, and non-discriminatory information about the administration of the State while protecting personal, group, and State secrets.
5. The principle of proportionality prioritizes the balance between the rights and obligations of state administrators.

---

<sup>9</sup> Sherry R. Arnstein, "A Ladder Of Citizen Participation," *Sherry R. Arnstein, "A Ladder Of Citizen Participation," Journal of the American Planning Association* 35 4 (1969): 216, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/01944366908977225>.

<sup>10</sup> Robertho Yanflor Gandaria, "Implementasi Asas-Asas Umum Pemerintahan Yang Baik (AAUPB) Dalam Mewujudkan Prinsip Good Governance And Clean Government Di Pemerintahan Daerah.," *Lex Administratum* III, no. 6 (2015): 5.

<sup>11</sup> Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, "Undang Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 28 Tahun 1999 Tentang Penyelenggara Negara Yang Bersih Dan Bebas Dari Korupsi, Kolusi Dan Nepotisme," 1999.

6. The Principle of Professionalism prioritizes expertise based on a code of ethics and the provisions of applicable laws and regulations.
7. The Principle of Accountability determines that the activities of the State administration should be accountable to the people as the highest sovereign holder of the State appropriate to applicable laws and regulations.

Based on Article 58 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, in implementing Regional Government as referred to in Article 57, the Regional Government Organizer is guided by the principles of state governance. These principles include a) legal certainty, b) orderly state administration, c) public interest, d) openness, e) proportionality, f) professionalism, g) accountability, h) efficiency, i) effectiveness, and j) justice.<sup>12</sup> The implementation of Good Governance is based on the laws and regulations in Indonesia. Therefore, the Magelang Cerdas application aims to facilitate information transparency, open public participation, and realize e-government in Magelang appropriate to applicable laws and regulations.

The development of E-Government implementation based on Good Governance can be measured through the effectiveness of communication patterns and their benefits to the public interest. In theory, the types of E-Government services to determine the level of Electronic Government services in the Magelang Cerdas Application and Monggo Lapor feature, Magelang City include, among others:<sup>13</sup>

1. Publish or one-way communication is a stage that uses information technology to expand access to government information and information for the community/public as a means that makes it easier to provide maximum Electronic Government services. In this case, publish is a level of Electronic Government communication where there is no feedback/response from the source.
2. Interact or two-way communication at the interact level, there is two-way communication between the government and the interested public. The government and society respond to each other for a specific purpose. At this level, the Public Relations Section of the Regional Secretariat of Magelang City communicates with the public by responding to complaints from the public sent via WhatsApp (082222202010), Facebook "Monggo Lapor" and Instagram "Monggo Lapor".
3. Transactions or transactions at this level occur in two-way interactions as in the interact class, except that a transaction is related to the transfer of money from one party to another. The government has an obligation to provide maximum service without burdening the community. Likewise with the Public Relations section of the Regional Secretariat of Magelang City which provides information services and public complaints without charging the slightest fee to the people of Magelang City.

---

<sup>12</sup> Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 Tentang Pemerintahan Daerah," 2014.

<sup>13</sup> Dwi Wahyu Ningsih, "E-Government Melalui Government To Citizen 'Monggo Lapor' Di Humas Pemerintah Kota Magelang," *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*, 6(11), 951–952. 02, no. 02 (2018): 10–27.

Based on the availability of E-Government services, if linked to the theory of Good Governance, the Monggo Lapor application has provided progress based on the level of public service at the Publish level, Monggo Lapor provides convenience in providing information that emphasizes the principles of good governance, namely the interests of the community, even though they have not yet opened a response from the source. Then, the Interact level has access to two-way communication which is supported through WhatsApp, Facebook and Instagram numbers as a means of further discussion in accordance with the principles of openness, efficiency and effectiveness in opening up wider discussion space between officials and the community. Finally, at the Transact level, officials as government administrators open transactions with service complainants and provide services free of charge in accordance with the principle of justice to ensure the rights of citizens are fulfilled. In addition to the 3 things above, the existence of a legal basis as legal certainty, a center for public complaints and information, good cooperation and communication between agencies and the high desire of the community for a forum for public complaints, the Magelang Cerdas with Monggo Lapor system, is support for the sustainability of E-Aspiration in Magelang City.

### **3.2. Development of the E-Aspiration towards the Smart City Realization in Magelang City**

It is necessary to approach and change methods in democracy to realize and increase public participation through smart cities. The changing times require that the government serves and empowers the people according to Good Governance applied through technology, such as a smart city. It is called a smart city when investments focus on modern transportation and ICT. Furthermore, the investments should encompass human and social capital to create sustainable economic growth and high life quality. This requires good management of natural resources through participatory governance.<sup>14</sup>

The practical objectives are more in the participatory governance and public participation factors in smart cities than in conventional democratic institutions. For instance, it entails improving the government's responsiveness and effectiveness in maintaining public trust optimally. Public participation also creates better, fairer, and more involved governance conditions with consideration and accountability. According to Fung, three dimensions of direct participation are important in the participatory governance model. The first dimension is the existence of participants and citizens that want to be involved. Meanwhile, other processes could also involve interested parties with authority to represent. The second dimension is participation as a means of creating a result or decision rather than just building communication. Generally, participants only

---

<sup>14</sup> Chiara Del Bo & Peter Nijkamp Andrea Caragliu, "Smart Cities in Europe," *Journal of Urban Technology* 18 18, no. 2 (2011): 65–82, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/10630732.2011.601117>.

act as listeners and do not take part in making certain decisions. The third dimension is a reciprocal relationship in participation between discussion, public activity, and policy.<sup>15</sup>

People are free to participate in the process and determination of government policies by identifying problems and potential solutions. Therefore, the positive impact of development is expected to be directly felt by the community. Regional development is effective and efficient in utilizing resources when supported by responsible people. The development could be a lesson in creating solidarity and forming independent characters that help decide the region's future together with the government. In line with this, the smart city is expected to allow public participation and increase the input and criticism to the government. Major cities in Indonesia, such as Jakarta, Bandung, Tangerang, Malang, and Surabaya, have conducted e-Musrenbang programs or electronic development planning meetings. Musrenbang is a forum where interested parties gather to prepare national and regional development plans. This forum could produce long-term, medium-term, and short-term development plans implemented by state administrators and the community.

The e-Musrenbang was created as a planning innovation with advances in information and communication technology utilized to receive the widest possible public participation in various development proposals. However, implementing a policy system has pros and cons that impact effectiveness. For instance, the implementation of e-Musrenbang in Surabaya City since 2010 has faced obstacles related to public participation, which is considered unsatisfactory. Subsequently, the access provided in capturing representation is insufficient to guarantee that the aspirations of the lower people become part of decision-making at a later stage. The opportunity to convey aspirations has not been widely felt by the community. Additionally, aspirations or proposals are only given to a few local elite actors, such as hamlet or village leaders.<sup>16</sup>

The e-Musrenbang system is also implemented by Magelang City Government using the term e-aspiration. It is the embodiment of online Musrenbang, developed and used on a non-budget basis since 2015. The purpose of the e-aspiration is to provide easy and fast access for people to convey their aspirations, criticisms, suggestions, and proposals to the government. The Magelang City Government expects this channel to capture the aspirations of more people than through the Musrenbang forum. However, data showed that e-aspiration is a new menu added to the Magelang Regional Planning, Research, and Development Agency website, which provides a guestbook feature. The comparison of aspirations submitted through the e-aspiration with the number of visitors

---

<sup>15</sup> Archon Fung, "Varieties of Participation in Complex Governance," *Public Administration Review* 66 66 (2006): 66–75.

<sup>16</sup> Novy Setia Yunas, "Efektivitas E-Musrenbang Di Kota Surabaya Dalam Sistem Perencanaan Pembangunan Berparadigma Masyarakat," *Otoritas: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan* 7, no. 1 (2017): 19–27, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.26618/ojip.v7i1.387>.



to the website is only about 8: 1000 or 0.008% based on data available until August 2017.<sup>17</sup>

The e-participation implementation through e-Musrenbang in Surabaya and Magelang Cities are still unsatisfactory. Public participation cannot be channeled thoroughly because the opportunity to convey aspirations is not created widely. This is because the proposal is only given to certain parties, such as hamlet or village heads. In this case, there is still a need to improve the concept of smart people as a group with aspirations delivered through participation. In this situation, smart people are one of the six smart city characteristics elements in supporting public participation in the Europe smart city model by Giffinger & Gudrun. Giffinger stated that a smart city has good performance in the six characteristics of smart people, living, economy, environment, governance, and mobility. The characteristics are built with a combination of support, decisions or regulations, freedom, and people's awareness in determining their activities. This definition indicates that the role of the people is important in building a smart city. The six characteristics in are smart economy, people, environment, living, mobility, and governance. Furthermore, the characteristics of smart governance and people are related and important in public participation. Each character has relevant factors and indicators that determine the success of a city's participation through smart governance. These indicators include city participation per population, people's political activities, and the importance of politics for the people in conveying aspirations. Other indicators are women's representation, city spending per population, satisfaction with school quality, bureaucratic transparency, and the eradication of corruption.<sup>18</sup>

Smart governance reflects political participation, services provided for people, and administrative functions. Good Governance is a reflection of smart governance creation, which is closely related to public participation. Smart governance is shaped by six factors, including public participation in decision-making, public and social services, transparent government, as well as political strategies and perspectives. It is also synonymous with using new communication channels open to the public, such as e-government and e-democracy.<sup>19</sup> Additionally, the e-aspiration using the e-Musrenbang system promotes a government responsive to people's needs and aspirations. It also

---

<sup>17</sup> Aila Diastru, "Penggunaan E-Government Dan Media Sosial Oleh Pemerintah Kota Magelang Dalam Proses Pembangunan Partisipatif (Transisi Kota Magelang Menjadi Kota Cerdas)" (Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2017).

<sup>18</sup> Rudolf Giffinger and Haindlmaier Gudrun, "Smart Cities Ranking: An Effective Instrument for the Positioning of the Cities?," *ACE: Architecture, City and Environment*, 2010, 7–25, <https://doi.org/10.5821/ace.v4i12.2483>.

<sup>19</sup> Zainal A Hasibuan, "Standarisasi Aplikasi E-Government Untuk Instansi Pemerintah," in *Prosiding Konferensi Nasional Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi Indonesia* (Bandung: ITB, 2005), 42–48.

promotes the utilization of information disclosure, public participation in the governance system, and good e-government.

#### 4. CONCLUSION

Magelang City Government has involved public e-participation in improving the public service quality and optimizing participation in building the Smart City. E-participation is accessed through the Monggo Lapor feature provided by the Magelang Cerdas application with Monggo Lapor System. Based on level of public service at the Publish level, Monggo Lapor provides convenience in providing information that emphasizes the principles of good governance, namely the interests of the community. The e-aspiration manifests online Musrenbang developed and used in a non-budgetary manner by the Magelang City Government since 2015. It aims to provide easy and fast access for people to convey their aspirations, criticisms, suggestions and proposals to the government as Smart Governance towards realizing the Smart City. However, its implementation has not been maximized in arousing public participation. This has moved the government to provide and accommodate digital aspiration services in Magelang Cerdas. The steps are consistent with the principle of Good Governance in Article 58 Law Number 23 of 2014 on Local Government Organizers. This is appropriate to the Magelang City Government, which has allowed public participation to ensure the right to channel people's opinions.

#### REFERENCES

- Andrea Caragliu, Chiara Del Bo & Peter Nijkamp. "Smart Cities in Europe." *Journal of Urban Technology* 18 18, no. 2 (2011): 65–82. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/10630732.2011.601117>.
- Diastrri, Aila. "Penggunaan E-Government Dan Media Sosial Oleh Pemerintah Kota Magelang Dalam Proses Pembangunan Partisipatif (Transisi Kota Magelang Menjadi Kota Cerdas)." Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2017.
- Fung, Archon. "Varieties of Participation in Complex Governance." *Public Administration Review* 66 66 (2006): 66–75.
- Gandaria, Robertho Yanflor. "Implementasi Asas-Asas Umum Pemerintahan Yang Baik (AAUPB) Dalam Mewujudkan Prinsip Good Governance And Clean Government Di Pemerintahan Daerah." *Lex Administratum* III, no. 6 (2015): 5.
- Giffinger, Rudolf, and Haindlmaier Gudrun. "Smart Cities Ranking: An Effective Instrument for the Positioning of the Cities?" *ACE: Architecture, City and Environment*, 2010, 7–25. <https://doi.org/10.5821/ace.v4i12.2483>.
- Hasibuan, Zainal A. "Standardisasi Aplikasi E-Government Untuk Instansi Pemerintah." In *Prosiding Konferensi Nasional Teknologi Informasi Dan Komunikasi Indonesia*, 42–48. Bandung: ITB, 2005.
- Indonesia, Pemerintah Republik. "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 Tentang Pemerintahan Daerah," 2014.
- Indonesia, Pemerintah Republik. "Undang Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 28 Tahun

- 1999 Tentang Penyelenggara Negara Yang Bersih Dan Bebas Dari Korupsi, Kolusi Dan Nepotisme,” 1999.
- Kominfo. “Pengguna Internet Indonesia Nomor Enam Dunia,” 2014.
- Ningsih, Dwi Wahyu. “E-Government Melalui Government To Citizen ‘Monggo Lapor’ Di Humas Pemerintah Kota Magelang.” *Angewandte Chemie International Edition*, 6(11), 951–952. 02, no. 02 (2018): 10–27.
- Nugroho, Trisapto. “Analisis E-Government Terhadap Pelayanan Publik Di Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham (Analysis of E-Government to Public Services in the Ministry of Law and Human Rights).” *Jurnal Ilmiah Kebijakan Hukum* 10, no. 3 (2016): 279–96.
- Pangestiningrum, Kristia Putri, Joko Tri Nugraha, and Mahendrati Mahendrati. “Manajemen Aplikasi ‘Magelang Cerdas’ Sebagai Salah Satu Inovasi Sektor Publik Menuju Smart City Di Kota Magelang.” *Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Kajian Media* 3, no. 1 (2019): 24–36.
- Riwanto, Agus. “Construction of Legal Culture Model for Corruption Prevention Through Social Media in Indonesia.” *Jurnal Hukum Dan Peradilan* 11, no. 3 (2022): 385. <https://doi.org/10.25216/jhp.11.3.2022.385-404>.
- Sherry R. Arnstein. “A Ladder Of Citizen Participation.” *Sherry R. Arnstein, “A Ladder Of Citizen Participation,” Journal of the American Planning Association* 35 4 (1969): 216. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/01944366908977225>.
- Statista Research Department. “Countries With The Highest Number of Internet Users 2022,” 2022.
- Sutriadi, Ridwan. *10 Langkah Mencerdaskan Kota, Seri Smart City Dari Sisi Perencanaan Kota*. Smart City. Bandung: ITB, 2017.
- Warsono, RM Mahendrati dan Hardi. “Peningkatan Kapasitas Aplikasi Mobile ‘Magelang Cerdas’ Dalam Rangka Peningkatan Pelayanan Publik.” *JPALG (Journal of Public Administration and Local Governance)* 4, no. 2 (2020): 124–40. <https://doi.org/10.31002/jpalg.v4i1.2394>.
- Yunas, Novy Setia. “Efektivitas E-Musrenbang Di Kota Surabaya Dalam Sistem Perencanaan Pembangunan Berparadigma Masyarakat.” *Otoritas: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan* 7, no. 1 (2017): 19–27. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.26618/ojip.v7i1.387>.

